

# Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Project

## CREATIVE & PERFORMING ARTS

### Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Statement December 2010



AUSTRALIAN  
LEARNING  
& TEACHING  
COUNCIL

Promoting excellence in higher education

An initiative of the Australian Government Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations

## CONTENTS

Executive Summary	01
1. Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Project Background	03
1.1 Discipline areas encompassed in the demonstration project	03
2. Creative and Performing Arts in the Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Project	04
2.1 Scope	04
2.2 Rationale	04
2.3 Consultation and development process	05
3. Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Statement for Creative and Performing Arts	10
3.1 Nature and extent of the Creative and Performing Arts	10
3.2 Threshold learning outcomes for Creative and Performing Arts	11
4. Notes on Threshold Learning Outcomes for Creative and Performing Arts	13
4.1 General comments	13
4.2 Creative and Performing Arts learning outcome commentary	14
5. Appendices	18
Appendix 1: Discipline Reference Group: Terms of reference and membership	18
Appendix 2: International, AQF and professional accreditation comparison	19
Appendix 3: Useful references	27
Appendix 4: Abbreviations	29



# CREATIVE AND PERFORMING ARTS STANDARDS

## Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Project

### Creative and Performing Arts Academic Standards Statement

December 2010

#### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Creative and Performing Arts learning outcome statements have been devised to represent the national standard for graduates in bachelor and coursework masters degrees in creative writing; dance; drama and performance; music and sound; screen and media; and visual art.

In March, 2010, a Discipline Reference Group (DRG) was formed to draft the learning outcomes. It met three times to develop, refine and endorse them. The chairs of the peak academic bodies in creative and performing arts were invited to join the group along with two deans representing the university sector, and one representative from the private sector. This insured that consultation flowed on to the extensive membership of the peak bodies within both the university and private sector.

The project involved extensive research of current higher education literature on academic standards. Information on graduate attributes and university-specific learning outcome statements was also retrieved; and a comprehensive map of practice-led creative and performing arts degree programs and majors offered in Australia was assembled. The higher education academic standards in creative and performing arts in Europe, the UK and North America were also considered and a survey, focusing on the perceived importance and development of the learning outcomes in higher education institutions, was directed to graduates, academic staff, practitioners and employers. A total of 252 respondents completed the survey.

Following widespread early discussion and fact-finding, once the draft learning outcomes had been approved in principle by the DRG in late May, Discipline Scholar, Professor Jonathan Holmes, began an extensive process of consultation, delivering keynote addresses at conferences and workshops held by the Australian Council of University Art and Design Schools (ACUADS), the Australian Screen Production and Research Association (ASPERA), the Australasian Association of Writing Programs (AAWP), the Australasian Association for Theatre, Drama and Performance Studies (ADSA) the National Council of Tertiary Music Schools (NACTMUS) and the Deans of Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (DASSH). A further 28 workshops were also presented at university venues across Australia.

Endorsement of the learning outcomes for the Creative and Performing Arts has been received from AAWP, ACUADS, ADSA, ASPERA, NACTMUS,

the Tertiary Dance Council of Australia (TDCA) and DASSH, and 'in principle endorsement' from the first ever meeting of the Deans and Directors of Faculties, Colleges and Schools of Creative and Performing Arts held on 15 October, 2010 at The University of New South Wales. The Deans of Creative and Performing Arts will meet again in early 2011 and it is expected that an associate deans network will be created to assist in the further development of the Learning and Teaching Academic Standards project.

The project team is indebted to the hundreds of individuals in the organisations and institutions cited above who have given generous and unstinting criticism, comment and support to establish a national suite of learning outcomes for the creative and performing arts. This has been a major achievement for the sector. A particularly special vote of thanks should go to friends and colleagues in the School of Art, the Faculty of Arts and the Centre for the Advancement of Learning and Teaching at the University of Tasmania for their extensive support and encouragement.

### **Project Leaders**

**Discipline Scholar:** Professor Jonathan Holmes

**Project Officer:** Ms Wendy Fountain

# 1. Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Project Background

The Australian Government is developing a new Higher Education Quality and Regulatory Framework which includes the establishment of the Tertiary Education Quality and Standards Agency (TEQSA).

TEQSA will be a national body for regulation and quality assurance of tertiary education against agreed standards. In developing the standards, the Australian Government is committed to the active involvement of the academic community. The Australian Government has commissioned the Australian Learning and Teaching Council (ALTC) to manage aspects of the Learning and Teaching Academic Standards component of the framework. The approach was designed to ensure that discipline communities would define and take responsibility for implementing academic standards within the academic traditions of collegiality, peer review, pre-eminence of disciplines and academic autonomy.

In 2010, both directly through a specific contract and indirectly through base funding of the ALTC, the Australian Government funded a one-year demonstration project to define minimum discipline-based learning outcomes as part of the development of Learning and Teaching Academic Standards.

The project took as its starting point the award level descriptors defined in the Australian Qualifications Framework (AQF). Threshold learning outcomes (TLOs) were defined in terms of minimum discipline knowledge, discipline specific skills and professional capabilities including attitudes and professional values that are expected of a graduate from a specified level of program in a specified discipline area. The process took account of and involved the participation of professional bodies, accreditation bodies, employers and graduates as well as academic institutions and teachers. These representatives of the discipline communities were encouraged to take responsibility for the project and the outcomes within broad common parameters. Some disciplines extended the brief to begin consideration of the implications of implementing standards at institutional level.

## 1.1 Discipline areas encompassed in the demonstration project

Broad discipline areas were defined according to Australian definitions of Field of Education from the Australian Standard Classification of Education. They correspond to the most common broad structural arrangements of faculties or aggregates of departments within Australian universities.

Eight broad discipline groups participated in 2010:

- architecture and building
- arts, social sciences and humanities
- business, management and economics
- creative and performing arts
- engineering and ICT
- health, medicine, and veterinary science
- law
- science.

Discipline Scholars were appointed to lead each discipline area. The key deliverable for each Discipline Scholar was the production of a document of minimum learning outcomes for a specified discipline at an agreed AQF level or levels. This booklet represents that outcome for this discipline.

## 2. Creative and Performing Arts in the Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Project

### 2.1 Scope

At the national forum held by the Australian Learning and Teaching Council (ALTC) in February 2010, a panel of experts in Creative and Performing Arts recommended that the Discipline Scholar explore the possibility of developing a suite of threshold learning outcome statements that can be applied to all bachelor degrees offered in the Creative and Performing Arts disciplines rather than to attempt to create separate suites of statements for each of the fields of study. In the event that this was achieved during 2010, consideration would be given to developing learning outcome statements for coursework masters degrees.

The decision was made to focus on the following disciplines:

- creative writing
- dance
- music and sound
- screen and media
- drama and performance
- visual arts.

### 2.2 Rationale

This group of disciplines is brought together in Division 19: Studies in Creative Arts and Writing in the Australian and New Zealand Research Classification (ANZSRC) (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2008).

This division has six groups:

- 1901 Art theory and criticism
- 1902 Film, television and digital media
- 1903 Journalism and professional writing
- 1904 Performing arts and creative writing
- 1905 Visual arts and crafts
- 1999 Other studies in creative arts and writing.

Although the discipline of design is sometimes grouped with visual arts at the institutional level in Australia, design practice and management is included in Division 12 of the ANZSRC and is grouped with Architecture, Building and Urban and Regional Planning. For this reason and for the purposes of this demonstration project, design practice and management was not included within the Creative and Performing Arts portfolio. It should be noted, nevertheless, that in the UK and Europe the disciplines of art and design are brought together in the benchmarking process.

The other important decision that was made was to focus on standards as they apply to **practice-led** learning in the Creative and Performing Arts. While careful consideration was given to the significant nexus between practice and theory in all of the disciplines included in this project – a nexus that is reflected in the learning outcome statements – it was beyond the brief of this demonstration project to attempt to develop learning outcome statements for the specific fields of art theory and criticism, critical and literary studies, musicology and music history, theatre and dance history and theory or other forms

of cultural history and theory that, for the most part, typically find their place in separate schools and divisions of the humanities in the higher education sector here in Australia, the UK and Europe.

A further reason for deciding on this strategy is that in the UK benchmark statements for Art and Design, a separation between practice and theory is clearly made.

A further compelling reason for grouping these disciplines together is that in the European Tuning project, a similar process has occurred with the membership of the *Inter|artes Thematic Network* consisting of more than 70 of the leading academic institutions providing bachelor and higher degrees in the creative and performing arts. The Tuning documents emanating from this collaboration have been especially important in the framing of the Australian project.

## 2.3 Consultation and development process

### Discipline reference group

Following the February forum, the first task was to identify the likely membership of a discipline reference group that could provide the expertise to cover the disciplines selected. Unlike many of the other discipline groupings such as Law; Business; Engineering and ICT; and Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities, there is no specific deans council representing the Creative and Performing Arts, although many of the faculties and divisions that house these disciplines do have representation on the Council of the Deans of Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (DASSH). At the same time, there are many university colleges, divisions and faculties that consist entirely of Creative and Performing Arts programs – most with very substantial enrolments – and these are not represented by a council of deans.

On the other hand, since the early 1980s discipline-specific peak academic bodies have been established in visual arts and design (the Australian Council of University Art and Design Schools – ACUADS), in music (the National Council of Tertiary Music Schools – NACTMUS), in theatre and performance (the Australasian Association for Theatre, Drama and Performance Studies – ADSA), in screen, media and film studies (the Australian Screen Production & Research Association – ASPERA), in dance (the Tertiary Dance Council of Australia – TDCA) and creative writing (the Australasian Association of Writing Programs – AAWP). These organisations represent the interests of the academic disciplines, arranging conferences and symposia, monitoring key emerging issues in the Creative and Performing Arts, conducting educational and market research and, more generally, providing a forum for discussion and debate.

In light of this, the chairs of the peak bodies, together with the deans of two faculties incorporating Creative and Performing Arts, and a representative of the higher education private providers, were invited to join a Discipline Reference Group (DRG) to advise and assist the Discipline Scholar in developing the learning outcome statements. Not only have the members of the reference group provided expert advice but it has meant that, as the threshold learning outcome statements (TLOs) were being developed, the chairs of the peak academic bodies were able to liaise with their executive boards and to provide information to and gain feedback from their constituents.

### Drafting of learning threshold outcomes

A two-and-a-half-month period of research and consultation followed the National Forum in February, and then the Discipline Reference Group met in Sydney face-to-face to consider a draft set of six TLOs that could be applied to bachelor degrees offered in the Creative and Performing Arts.

In preparation for this draft, reference was made to a large number of documents and websites. Early in the project, a database was created that included a comprehensive listing of degree courses and programs in Creative and Performing Arts offered in Australia including, where possible, degree programs offered by private higher education providers. As part of the process, where the information was available, course and program coordinators as well as heads of schools, deans and directors were identified. Thus, it became possible to establish an extremely wide network of contacts for later stages in the project when a survey featuring the draft learning outcomes was launched. The network was also contacted once planning began on a nation-wide series of information workshops for October

and November, 2010. The establishment of the creative and performing arts leaders' network, CreateEd, funded by the ALTC, has also been an invaluable resource.<sup>1</sup>

The research also yielded a great deal of information relating to learning and teaching expectations that universities and other higher education providers make available on their various websites (including discipline-specific outcomes and more generic graduate attribute statements). This material was invaluable as the drafting process developed.

The project was guided by the Australian Qualifications Framework (AQF) publications. Particular attention was given to the AQF Council's *Strengthening the AQF: A Framework for Australia's Qualifications Consultation Paper* when it was published mid-year (July 2010) especially with relation to the statements regarding AQF qualification type descriptors for Level 7: bachelors degrees (p.16) and Level 9: coursework masters degrees (p.18) and their further elaboration in the sections titled 'AQF specifications for the bachelor degree' (pp.32–33) and 'AQF specifications for the masters degree' (pp.36–37).<sup>2</sup>

Extensive study of quality assurance frameworks in Europe, the UK and North America was carried out with particular attention being given to the 'Dublin descriptors' as they have been interpreted in European Tuning project<sup>3</sup> and the way in which, in Europe, these were developed into learning outcome descriptors for first, second and third cycle awards in higher music education, visual art and design, theatre and dance. The learning outcome framework developed by the discipline communities in Creative and Performing Arts in Europe has been extremely important to this present project and this is noted and acknowledged in the commentary that accompanies the learning outcome statements that follow. It should also be noted here that the European League of Institutes of the Arts (ELIA, formed in 1990) and the European Association of Conservatoires (AEC, formed in 1953) have been influential in promoting tertiary education in the Creative and Performing Arts and particularly in positioning these disciplines within the Bologna process.<sup>4</sup>

Careful consideration was also given to the UK's Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) *Honours Degree Benchmark Statements* in art and design/ history of art, architecture and design (2008);<sup>5</sup> communication, media, film and cultural studies (2008);<sup>6</sup> dance, drama and performance (2007);<sup>7</sup> english (2007);<sup>8</sup> and music (2008).

Several issues emerged during the study of the UK benchmark statements and helped to frame the draft TLO statements in this project. The UK standards include both *threshold* and *typical* standards and, thus, usually contain a quite large number of learning outcome expectations including those that identify the more aspirational outcomes that the disciplines consider to be appropriate at the bachelor degree level. Early on in the Australian Learning and Teaching Academic Standards (LTAS) demonstration project, it was decided that the ALTC would focus on a small number of *threshold* statements, leaving universities and other higher education providers to identify the more aspirational standards that might typically define the distinctiveness of their own discipline offerings. The UK benchmark statements in the Creative and Performing Arts provide an excellent guide to these more advanced standards in this regard, and provide a valuable resource for the LTAS project as it is developed under the Tertiary Education Quality and Standards Agency (TEQSA). For the purposes of this demonstration project, however, the Discipline Reference Group only focused on the threshold statements.

The UK QAA Benchmark Statements do not include a discipline entry specifically related to creative writing although it is recognised as being incorporated in the nature and scope of the discipline of English. (*Quality Assurance Agency: Subject benchmark statement for English*, 2007, p. 2). The notes on creative writing are, nonetheless, only very brief and so the National Association of Writers in Education subject benchmark statement published in 2008 was consulted.<sup>9</sup>



Other significant documents consulted included the quality assurance handbooks published by the following North American associations:

- National Association of Schools of Art and Design<sup>10</sup>
- National Association of Schools of Dance<sup>11</sup>
- National Association of Schools of Music<sup>12</sup>
- National Association of Schools of Theatre.<sup>13</sup>

These are comprehensive documents that provide regulatory and standards guidelines for all aspects of the tertiary delivery of programs in Creative and Performing Arts. The handbooks are laid out in a common template that is easily consulted and, like the QAA Benchmark Statements, are readily accessed on the internet.

The American guidelines are provided for both majors and programs within liberal arts courses as well as for the more specific courses in theatre, visual arts, music, dance, and film and television that are offered at degree level. The most typical awards at first degree level are the Bachelor of Fine Arts and the Bachelor of Music. While the standards associated with majors offered in liberal arts degrees and similar awards were considered, attention was focused upon the standards associated with these latter awards. These align relatively clearly with the TLOs that occur both in the UK Subject Benchmark Statements in creative and performing arts and those published in visual arts, music, theatre and dance in the European Tuning project.

In each of the international examples cited above, the identified learning outcomes or benchmark statements were often quite numerous: in the UK Benchmark Statement for Art and Design, for instance, the threshold standard includes 16 dot points under the over-arching framework of 'subject-specific knowledge and understanding, attributes and skills'. In Europe, the 1st Cycle Learning Outcomes and Competencies in Dance are defined under the following broad headings:

- technical/artistic skills
- theoretical outcomes

These are then arranged under several further headings and each of these sub-headings includes a further three or four dot points identifying more detailed learning outcome expectations.

A similar level of detail is also apparent in the North American model.

### Presentation of draft learning outcome statements

The draft TLOs below were drawn up within this context although they take into account the aim of the ALTC project that the threshold statements should be limited to six to eight statements.

When the Discipline Reference Group (DRG) met in Sydney on 15 April, there was broad agreement that the draft learning outcomes represented the expectations held by the reference group although, at the time, it was clear that there would be a period of considerable reflection on and refinement of the statements before they were widely gazetted within the discipline communities.

Given that this level of agreement had been achieved in the DRG at this stage, it was resolved that the Discipline Scholar should revise the current draft of statements for bachelors degrees and would develop a draft set of coursework masters statements for consideration at the following DRG meeting in Sydney on 31 May 2010.

In the intervening period the drafts of the bachelor degree TLOs underwent a very substantial revision as numerous academics, including specialists in academic assessment in Creative and Performing Arts, deans, associate deans, program directors and course coordinators were consulted. Meanwhile, research was undertaken on postgraduate learning outcomes with particular attention being given to the work that has been carried out by the *Inter|artes Thematic Network* and *Polifonia*, – *Erasmus Thematic Network for Music* in the European Tuning project. In Europe, learning outcomes for

postgraduate degrees in the Creative and Performing Arts have been well-established in recent years and their example helped to shape the drafting of the TLO statements which have subsequently been developed for Australia.

### Endorsement of draft threshold learning outcome statements

The aim of this demonstration project has been to insure that widespread consultation with the discipline communities has occurred as these TLOs have been developed and it has been very important to make certain that the process is 'owned' by the disciplines. At the 31 May meeting of the DRG, both sets of draft TLOs were endorsed and plans were established to communicate extensively with the discipline communities. In particular, because the membership of the reference group has consisted of chairs of the peak academic bodies, it was decided that the Discipline Scholar would present keynote addresses at the national conferences of the following:

- Australasian Association for Theatre, Drama and Performance Studies (Australian National University, 30 June)
- Australian Screen Production & Research Association (University of Technology, Sydney, 7 July)
- National Association of Tertiary Music Schools (AusMusic, Melbourne, 20 July)
- Australian Council of University Art and Design Schools (UTas, Launceston, 2 September)
- Deans of Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (Fremantle, 1 October)
- Deans and Directors, Faculties, Colleges and Schools of Creative and Performing Arts (UNSW, 15 October)
- Australasian Association of Writing Programs (RMIT, 26 November).

Following each of these keynote addresses, the chairs and/or convenors of the above bodies sought 'in principle' endorsement of the draft TLOs from their boards.

### Preparation of survey and establishment of newsletter

In June and July 2010 a Creative and Performing Arts newsletter including the background to the project and the learning outcomes was sent out to all deans, associate deans and heads of schools in the disciplines for circulation amongst their colleagues. Invitations were extended to students, academics, employers and professionals in the field to provide feedback on their views about the draft TLOs.

At the same time, a survey was created canvassing views on the kinds of learning outcomes one might typically expect a graduate in Creative and Performing Arts to achieve. The survey was circulated to academics, graduates, employers and professionals. It asked them to consider a set of questions about whether particular learning outcomes were thought to be appropriate for bachelor and coursework masters degrees and whether these had been achieved in the program that they undertook. A total of 252 respondents completed the survey.

### National consultation

Apart from the conference presentations, the Discipline Scholar gave presentations at a large number of other forums, and workshops were arranged in all metropolitan centres and through most regional universities in Australia during October and November 2010. The aim of the workshops was to introduce academic staff – particularly course, program and unit coordinators – to the demonstration project and the draft TLOs and to facilitate discussion of their likely impact on course and program design, assessment and data retrieval in the coming years.

- 1 <https://createdleadership.groupsite.com/main/summary> Viewed: 27 November 2010.
- 2 Australian Qualifications Framework Council, *Strengthening the AQF: A framework for Australia's qualifications. Consultation Paper*, Adelaide: AQF, July, 2010.
- 3 <http://www.jointquality.nl/content/descriptors/CompletesetDublinDescriptors.doc> Viewed: 27 November 2010.
- 4 ELIA and AEC have produced several important position papers together in recent years including 'Towards Strong Creative Arts Disciplines in Europe.' Viewed: 13 September 2010. [http://www.elia-artschools.org/publications/position/position\\_3.xml](http://www.elia-artschools.org/publications/position/position_3.xml)
- 5 <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/ADHA08.asp>
- 6 <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/CMF08.asp>
- 7 <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/DDP07.asp>
- 8 <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/English07.asp>
- 9 National Association of Writers in Education[NAWE] Higher Education Committee, *Creative writing subject benchmark statement and Creative writing research benchmark statement* September 2008. Viewed 13 September 2010. [www.english.heacademy.ac.uk/archive/publications/reports/cwgguide.pdf](http://www.english.heacademy.ac.uk/archive/publications/reports/cwgguide.pdf)
10. NASAD Handbook 2009-10: October 2009 Edition. <http://nasad.arts-accredit.org/index.jsp?page=Books> Viewed 13 September 2010
11. NASD Handbook 2009-10: September 2009 Edition. <http://nasd.arts-accredit.org/index.jsp?page=Books> Viewed 13 September 2010
12. NASM Handbook 2009-10: December 2009 Edition. <http://nasm.arts-accredit.org/index.jsp?page=Books> Viewed 13 September 2010
13. NAST Handbook 2010-11: April 2010 Edition. <http://nast.arts-accredit.org/index.jsp?page=Books> Viewed 13 September 2010



# 3. Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Statement for Creative and Performing Arts

## 3.1 Nature and extent of the Creative and Performing Arts

Bachelor and postgraduate degrees in Creative and Performing Arts are offered by almost all Australian universities as well as by a range of other higher education providers. There are many reasons why such degree programs are in such high demand. First and foremost, these degrees provide a pathway into a flourishing arts industry that has a highly significant impact on the lives of most Australians.

The importance of the creative arts to Australians is thus reflected in a strong demand for a higher education in the field. In 2008 in the Australian higher education sector, the full-time equivalent of 11,998 students commenced study in the Creative Arts (number of students: 23,193); in 2009 commencements increased by 15.9 per cent to 13,907 students (number of students: 27,085).

In 2008, the **total** enrolment of full-time equivalent students in Creative Arts in the higher education sector was 29,392 (number of students: 64,350). This had increased by 10.2 per cent in 2009 to 32,391 (number of students: 70,454). In 2009 this represented 7.9 per cent of all enrolments in the higher education sector.<sup>14</sup> In the creative arts there has been a 14 per cent increase in enrolments since 2004. (Australian Bureau of Statistics, <http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/mf/6281.0/>)

Of the broad discipline groups, only enrolments in the natural and physical sciences (11.9 per cent), health (11.6 per cent), management and commerce (20.6 per cent) and society and culture (25.9 per cent) exceeded those of the creative arts in 2009.<sup>15</sup>

The Australian Bureau of Statistics (April 2007) reported that during the previous 12 months “an estimated 3.5 million (22 per cent) of Australians aged 15 years and over were involved in some form of paid or unpaid work relating to the selected culture and leisure activities covered in the survey”.<sup>16</sup> While this report also included leisure activities such as work in libraries and archives, heritage organisations, botanic gardens, national parks and reserves and zoos and aquaria, the vast majority of activities cited in the survey were in the creative and performing arts.

In the *Report of the Contemporary Visual Arts and Craft Inquiry*, it is noted that the visual arts and crafts sector had “around 20,000 visual artists and craft practitioners as well as curators, arts writers and other arts workers, and hundreds of organisations ranging from small artist-run initiatives to the major state galleries” (Department of Communications, Information Technology and the Arts, 2002 p. 5).

Screen Australia notes, furthermore, that in 2006 over 45,000 people were employed in audiovisual industries (Screen Australia 2010). Sixty-six per cent of all Australians went to the cinema at least once in 2008 and, on average, this group attended the cinema 7.3 times. Of the 349 films released in Australia in 2009, 46 were made in Australia.<sup>17</sup>

Many graduates from a range of Creative and Performing Arts degrees are employed in the media – an industry which reaches a huge audience in Australia. In 2009, 99 per cent of Australian metropolitan households owned a television and 68 per cent had two or more sets. According to Roy Morgan Research, “in a typical week the average Australian adult spent 21 hours and 46 minutes watching television”. (Screen Australia, 2010).<sup>18</sup> Participation rates in associated media such as radio, the internet and online services are also high and increasing.

According to the 2006 Census of Population and Housing, the main job of 296,183 people was in a cultural industry (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2009). This is far exceeded by the number of people involved part-time either in paid or unpaid cultural activities. The Australian Bureau of Statistics 2007

survey 'Work in selected culture and leisure activities' reports that 1.4 million persons had a paid or unpaid involvement in **visual art** activities during 2006–07. A further 960,800 persons (or 27 per cent of all persons involved) had an involvement in **craft** activities. The figures for other activities are also very significant. There were 506,300 persons involved in the **performing arts**; 459,200 in **design**; 409,800 in **festival organising**; 335,100 in music and 606,500 in **writing**.

Among many occupations, graduates from Creative and Performing Arts degrees become artists, craftspeople, actors, dancers, choreographers, scenographers, writers, composers, musicians, comedians, film and TV directors and producers, copywriters, editors, illustrators, teachers, museum professionals and curators, website and electronic games designers, interactive display designers, theatre directors and designers, recording, lighting and sound technicians, publishers, events managers, photo-journalists, creative directors and arts administrators.

Not only do these graduates become front-line professionals in the arts but many other graduates lead successful and fulfilling professional lives combining their own creative practice with other forms of work; others find equally successful careers working full- or part-time in the myriad of other occupations that populate the arts industries in Australia; others move into other discipline-specific professions enriched by the focus a Creative or Performing Arts degree places on the skills, knowledge and understanding of creative practice, its languages, forms, materials and techniques and the technologies it embraces.

Typically, graduates in Creative and Performing Arts will be able to demonstrate a range of skills and knowledge relating to the discipline of their choice and will have the capacity to think creatively, critically and reflectively. They will be able to communicate effectively in a range of modes and contexts and will have the capacity to produce works, artefacts and forms of creative expression for public display. They will be able to work independently and to collaborate with others and can be expected to have a sound knowledge of national and international developments in their discipline.

### 3.2 Threshold learning outcomes for Creative and Performing Arts

The following learning outcomes for Creative and Performing Arts have been designed for the following disciplines:

- creative writing
- dance
- music and sound
- screen and media
- drama and performance
- visual arts.

Upon completion of a bachelor degree in Creative and Performing Arts, graduates will be able to:	Upon completion of a masters by coursework degree in Creative and Performing Arts, graduates will be able to:
Demonstrate skills and knowledge of the practices, languages, forms, materials, technologies and techniques in the Creative and Performing Arts discipline.	Integrate specialised and advanced skills with a developed knowledge of the Creative and Performing Arts discipline.
Develop, research and evaluate ideas, concepts and processes through creative, critical and reflective thinking and practice.	Generate, research and explore ideas, concepts and processes in the field through integrated creative, critical and reflective thinking.
Apply relevant skills and knowledge to produce and realise works, artefacts and forms of creative expression.	Apply and refine technical skills and specialist knowledge within a sustained and resolved body of work.
Interpret, communicate and present ideas, problems and arguments in modes suited to a range of audiences.	Interpret, communicate and present complex work and ideas to specialist and non-specialist audiences using professional conventions.
Work independently and collaboratively in the Creative and Performing Arts Discipline in response to project demands.	Initiate, lead, negotiate and interact with others in planning, adapting to and executing creative and performing arts projects.
Recognise and reflect on social, cultural and ethical issues, and apply local and international perspectives to practice in the Creative and Performing Arts Discipline.	Engage critically with social, cultural and ethical issues and apply local and international perspectives to extend practice in the Creative and Performing Arts Discipline.

14. Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations 'Statistics Publications (Summary Tables: Students 2009 [first half year]: selected higher education statistics - All Higher Education Providers)'. Viewed Saturday, 24 July 2010. <http://www.deewr.gov.au/HigherEducation/Publications/HEStatistics/Publications/Pages/Students.aspx>
15. Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations 'Statistics Publications (Summary Tables: Table (i) Summary of Student Numbers, 2003 and 2004)'. Viewed Saturday, 24 July 2010. <http://www.deewr.gov.au/HigherEducation/Publications/HEStatistics/Publications/Pages/2004HalfYear.aspx>
16. Australian Bureau of Statistics Work in Selected Culture and Leisure Activities. Viewed Saturday, 24 July 2010. <http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/mf/6281.0/>
17. Screen Australia 'Get the picture. Fast facts: Cinema'. Viewed Sunday, 25 July 2010. <http://www.screenaustralia.gov.au/gtp/fastcinema.html>
18. Peters, B 'Free-to-air television in Australia', in Screen Australia's Get the Picture. Viewed Sunday, 25 July 2010. <http://www.screenaustralia.gov.au/gtp/fastcinema.html>

## 4. Notes on the Threshold Learning Outcomes for Creative and Performing Arts

### 4.1 General comments

The threshold learning outcome statements (TLOs) have been developed within the context of the disciplines of the Creative and Performing Arts and take into account a number of presuppositions. These include, for instance, the need to capture the importance that collaborative practice plays in so many of the disciplines within this field. It is one of the first principles of professional practice in theatre, music, dance, and screen and media, that graduates will have to work in teams, ensembles, film and production crews, casts and creative workshops – to give just a few examples – and for this reason there is an expectation that graduates will be able to demonstrate a capacity to work in this context. While this might seem less relevant to the student undertaking a creative writing or visual arts program, the Discipline Reference Group (DRG) was of the view that such an expectation was equally important to ensure that graduates were equipped to work in a wide variety of situations that involve teamwork.

As noted earlier, these TLOs have been developed for the **practice-led** disciplines of the Creative and Performing Arts. It is important to stress here that there is no intention to diminish the importance and, indeed, the central role that a theoretical and historical understanding of the various arts plays in underpinning that practice: the ability to demonstrate this at the technical, conceptual, expressive and communication levels lies at the very heart of degree programs in Creative and Performing Arts. The DRG paid considerable attention to ensuring that this rigour was captured in the statements both at the bachelor and coursework masters levels.

Nevertheless, the aim of this particular project has been to create a suite of TLOs that capture what it means to practise as a professional in the Creative and Performing Arts. Although graduates may move into other fields within the disciplines or into other professions, one of the guiding principles of the project has been that there will be some form of summative assessment – usually in the final semester of the degree program – that will test the capacity of the graduating student to work as a creative or performing artist. To ‘major’ in composition, voice, choreography, theatre direction, performance, painting or film production usually requires that the student presents a proto-professional portfolio or performance or demonstration at the conclusion of the degree. The award of a bachelors degree in, fine art, music, theatre, dance, creative writing or film is based on the judgement of the degree-conferring institution and/or the judgement of external examiners that the graduate is now prepared to practise as a professional in the field. For the most part there is no further accrediting body that licenses the creative or performing artist to pursue his or her professional career.

At this stage, since this is a demonstration project, it has not been possible to develop TLOs for honours, research masters, research or professional doctoral degrees although all have been pursued in the Creative and Performing Arts disciplines for a number of years now. Part of the reason for focusing on the bachelor and coursework masters degrees rather than these other higher degrees, has been that the higher degrees, for the most part, have a longer tradition of using benchmark standards across institutions through the use of the external examination process. It, nevertheless, remains the case that there are substantial variations in the ways in which higher degrees in the creative and performing arts are offered in Australia and this is reflected in the recent findings of the ALTC-funded project, *CreativeArtsPhD: Future-proofing the creative arts in higher education. Scoping for quality of creative arts doctoral programs*. (Baker & Buckley, 2009). This variation will need to be addressed in the next phase of the Learning and Teaching Academic Standards (LTAS) project.

Since this has been a demonstration project, a method will have to be found to ensure that the present TLOs are reviewed on a regular basis and that steps are taken to develop a similar set of



statements for other higher degrees in the field. The current DRG, which includes the current chairs of the peak discipline bodies in the creative and performing arts, might be one structure that is employed. Alternatively, the nascent forum of Deans of Creative and Performing Arts might be the driver of the ongoing project. This will need to be resolved by the discipline communities and the higher education sector.

## 4.2. Creative and Performing Arts learning outcome commentary

### **Demonstrate skills and knowledge of the practice, languages, forms, materials, technologies and techniques in the creative arts discipline.**

This threshold learning outcome (TLO) at the bachelor degree level is linked to the AQF qualification type descriptor where graduates are expected to have “A broad and coherent body of knowledge, with depth in the underlying principles and concepts in one or more disciplines as a basis for independent lifelong learning”. (*Strengthening the AQF: A Framework for Australia’s Qualifications*, July 2010, p. 16).<sup>19</sup>

The Dublin descriptor relevant to this TLO describes a graduate who [has] “demonstrated knowledge and understanding in a field of study that builds upon their general secondary education, and is typically at a level that, whilst supported by advanced textbooks, includes some aspects that will be informed by knowledge of the forefront of their field of study”. (Shared ‘Dublin’ descriptors for Short Cycle, First Cycle, Second Cycle and Third Cycle Awards, October, 2004).

This will be interpreted slightly differently by each of the Creative and Performing Arts disciplines. For instance, the TLO uses ‘languages’ to suggest not only written and spoken language but also the forms of expression that are embodied, for instance, in dance, in music, in visual art and in gesture.

While the practice, forms, materials and techniques will obviously differ in each discipline, the view was held by the Discipline Reference Group (DRG) that the graduate should be able to demonstrate a level of expertise in each area at the end of the course. This is captured, for instance, in the Inter|artes Thematic Network *Visual Arts and Design Tuning Document* statement that a graduate in the First Cycle in visual arts will have an ability to “develop a professional working basis in processes, theories, technical skills and organisation/communication skills relevant to art practice”. (Inter|artes Thematic Network, *Performing Arts Tuning Document* n.d.)

Although consideration was also given to the idea of a separate TLO relating to technologies – a common graduate attribute included by many higher education providers – the view was held that skills and knowledge of recent and emerging technologies were now regarded as integral to courses in Creative and Performing Arts at the bachelor degree level and it was felt that, as such, this expectation should be included in this TLO.

### **Integrate specialised and advanced skills with a developed knowledge of the creative arts discipline.**

At the coursework masters degree level, the AQF states that graduates will have “a body of knowledge that includes the understanding of recent developments in a field of knowledge and/or area of professional practice”. As a result of their training graduates will be able “to apply an advanced body of knowledge in a range of contexts for professional practice or scholarship and/or as a pathway for further learning”. Among other qualities, the Dublin descriptor for Second Cycle degrees states that the graduate will have “the ability to integrate knowledge and handle complexity” at an extended level beyond that “typically associated with a bachelor’s degree”. (Dublin, 2004)

In the Second Cycle descriptor for dance, for instance, graduates should have the capacity to “intervene in the multiple contexts of a theatrical production revealing themselves as creative professionals, demonstrating a technical maturity and artistic awareness adapted to the expression and realisation of their own expressive concepts”. (Inter|artes Thematic Network, *Performing Arts Tuning Document* n.d.)

The Second Cycle descriptor for ‘Skills’ in visual arts and design includes the ability to be in “command of the main general and specific design skills, and basic expert skills in [one’s] own specialisation within the discipline” and in “command of the most important techniques and technologies relevant to the design discipline including techniques and technologies specific to [one’s] own specialization”. (Inter|artes Thematic Network, *Visual Arts and Design Tuning Document* n.d.)

The aim in this TLO has been to capture the idea that the graduate is not only demonstrating the ability to respond to a brief or a project guideline but has the capacity to work independently to employ his or her specialised and advanced skills.



**Develop, research and evaluate ideas, concepts and processes through creative, critical and reflective thinking and practice.**

Among the learning outcome descriptors that the AQF defines at this level is the ability to employ “Cognitive and creative skills to exercise critical thinking and judgement in identifying and solving problems with intellectual independence”. (AQF, 2010) The TLO represents a distillation of a number of similar statements that are to be found in the European tuning documents for the creative and performing arts. For instance, in the *Polifonia/Dublin Descriptors for 1st Cycle awards in Higher Music Education*, the authors state that graduates at this level should “have the ability to gather and interpret relevant data (usually within the field of music) to inform judgements within their practical/creative activity that include reflection on artistic and, where relevant, social, scientific or ethical issues”. (August, 2006)

**Apply relevant skills and knowledge to produce and realise works, artefacts and forms of creative expression.**

This TLO nests neatly with the AQF descriptor that states that graduates will be able to apply knowledge and skills “by applying fundamental principles, concepts and techniques to known and unknown situations with some direction”. At the same time, in the creative and performing arts TLO, the DRG seeks to affirm the primacy of the arts practice and its focus on a body of work as an important outcome of undertaking a Creative and/or Performing Arts degree. The terms used – ‘works’, ‘artefacts’ and ‘forms of creative expression’ – refer to the kinds of proto-professional portfolios that are commonly assessed in summative forms of examination at the completion of the major or degree program. The European Tuning descriptors for visual arts include the ability to “communicate and articulate ideas visually, verbally and in writing as appropriate” and “develop an art practice that includes the production and presentation of a body of work”; as well as “generate creative ideas, experimental methods, concepts, proposals and solutions”. (Inter)artes Thematic Network, *Visual Arts and Design Tuning Document* n.d.)

For a graduate in theatre there is an expectation that “he/she has [mastered] the techniques, materials and necessary technical equipment to the accomplishment of a production within his/her specific area” and presented “the effective communication of his/her creative and artistic performance/production role to an audience”. (Inter)artes Thematic Network, *Performing Arts Tuning Document* n.d.)

**Generate, research and explore ideas, concepts and processes in the field through integrated creative, critical and reflective thinking.**

At the masters by coursework level the AQF includes the following paragraph in the ‘Application of Knowledge and Skills’ section: Graduates will be able “to demonstrate creativity and initiative in the application of knowledge and skills to new situations in professional practice and/or for further learning”.

It should be noted here that there was considerable debate about the use of the term ‘research’ at the masters by coursework level since this is a professional rather than a research qualification and that the term should be reserved for honours and research higher degrees. The view was retained, nevertheless, that candidates would be expected to demonstrate the ability to retrieve and order information and ideas related to the projects that they developed and should do so with a substantial degree of independence.

**Apply and refine technical skills and specialist knowledge within a sustained and resolved body of work.**

The AQF descriptor for coursework masters degrees relating to the application of knowledge and skills states that the graduate will have the ability “to demonstrate the planning and execution of a substantial research-based project, capstone experience or piece of scholarship”. (AQF, 2010)

In the Creative and Performing Arts it is very common for the ‘capstone experience’ or ‘piece of scholarship’ to take the form of the exhibition or performance of a sustained and resolved body of work. It might be a short film or animation; a choreographed work; a sophisticated visual art installation; a 50-minute recital and accompanying recording; or a substantial piece of creative writing. In the latter case, for instance, outcomes of the course may lead to the publication of an anthology as has been the case in the University of Technology, Sydney’s *UTS Writer’s Anthology: I can see my house from here* (2010).

**Interpret, communicate and present ideas, problems and arguments in modes suited to a range of audiences.**

This is a relatively complex TLO statement in the context of both the bachelor and the coursework masters degree because it attempts to capture the idea that there are multiple forms of communication that require attention depending upon which creative or performing arts discipline is involved. For example, a 20- to 30-minute musical recital involving a public presentation or a drama production involving an ensemble of players will require precise learning objectives and clear assessment criteria and graduating students have to be able to adapt their 'voice', so to speak, to the different types of audience they may encounter. The TLO also seeks to capture another important aspect of communication that relates to a student's capacity to articulate ideas in the more conventional discourses of higher education such as written and spoken presentations.

The bachelor degree descriptor on communication in the AQF tends to focus attention on the latter. It states that the graduate should demonstrate the "communication skills to present a clear, coherent and independent exposition of knowledge and ideas" (AQF, 2010) although this does not quite capture the level of subtlety that needs to be expressed when one is dealing with the production of works of creative and performing art.

**Work independently and collaboratively in the creative arts discipline in response to project demands.**

This TLO aligns closely with the AQF descriptors for the bachelor degree that state that the graduate should have the ability "to adapt knowledge and skills in diverse contexts" and "to take responsibility and accountability for [their] own learning and professional practice and collaboration with others within broad parameters" (AQF, 2010).

In the foreword to this commentary, it was noted that a central feature of most creative and performing arts degrees is the expectation that the graduate will be required to work collaboratively at some stage of his or her professional career and, in highlighting this as a TLO, the DRG affirms its centrality as a key expectation in bachelor degree courses in creative and performing arts.

**Interpret, communicate and present complex work and ideas to specialist and non-specialist audiences using professional conventions.**

As noted in the bachelor level TLO, this is a complex issue for the creative and performing arts and especially difficult to capture in an encompassing statement. The AQF descriptor states that the graduate should have the "communication and technical research skills to justify theoretical propositions, methodologies, conclusions and professional decisions to specialist and non-specialist audiences" although this does not really encompass the kinds of creative communication one is typically looking for in, say, the production of a short film, a novel or an exhibition of ceramics. Clearly graduates must be equipped with the ability to communicate their ideas in written and verbal form but there is also the other practice-led expressive form of communication that is a desired learning outcome.

Even in the Inter}artes Thematic Network *Visual Arts and Design Tuning Document* Second Cycle descriptors, primacy is given to the conventional forms of communication. Graduates will have the ability to "articulate intentions, values and meanings of works produced to relevant audiences as well as non-specialised audiences" (Inter}artes Thematic Network, n.d). The use of the term 'professional conventions' in this learning outcome statement is intended as a flag to alert higher education providers to the need to interrogate the differing modes of communication that occur in the respective disciplines and the manner in which these are articulated in the learning objectives and the assessment of the learning outcomes.

**Initiate, lead, negotiate and interact with others in planning, adapting to, and executing creative arts projects.**

At the masters degree level, this TLO attempts to capture a similar idea of an integrated professional practice that is also articulated in the first two learning outcome statements above.

In the AQF definition, graduates are expected to have the ability:

- "to demonstrate creativity and initiative in the application of knowledge and skills to new situations in professional practice and/or for further learning
- to demonstrate high-level personal autonomy and accountability
- to demonstrate the planning and execution of a substantial research-based project, capstone experience or piece of scholarship" (AQF, 2010).

**Recognise and reflect on social, cultural and ethical issues, and apply local and international perspectives to practice in the creative arts discipline.**

Once again this is a complex TLO that defines a number of the threshold expectations for any graduate in a creative and/or performing arts degree. These include a sound knowledge of the theoretical and historical contexts in which the discipline is practised; an ability to carry out self-directed further study and research in the field; and an understanding of social, cultural and ethical contexts that frame both the practice and discourse of the discipline.

The descriptor for 'Critical awareness' in the 1st Cycle Learning Outcomes and Competencies for the discipline of Dance in the European Tuning project, graduates are expected to be:

- "be critically self-aware;
- be able to apply their critical capabilities to the work of others;
- have developed a broad social and civic awareness" (Inter}artes *Thematic Network*, *Performing Arts Tuning Document* n.d.).

The AQF is less specific in defining this expectation although the learning outcome sits within the broader descriptor that graduates will apply knowledge and skills "using judgement and initiative in professional practice and/or scholarship" (AQF, 2010).

**Engage critically with social, cultural and ethical issues, and apply local and international perspectives to extend practice in the creative arts discipline.**

At the masters degree level, this TLO is aligned with the AQF statement that graduates will have "a body of knowledge that includes the understanding of recent developments in a field of knowledge and/or area of professional practice" and that they will be able to use "technical and communication skills to design, evaluate, implement, analyse and theorise about developments that contribute to professional practice or scholarship" (AQF, 2010).

## Appendix 1: Discipline Reference Group: Terms of Reference and Membership

### Terms of reference

The following terms of reference were established for the Discipline Reference Group (DRG).

- To assist the Discipline Scholar in reviewing and revising a set of indicative threshold learning outcome statements (TLOs) for undergraduate degrees in Creative and Performing Arts
- To consider (and, if possible, to endorse) the draft (TLOs) to be presented at the reference group meeting on 31 May, 2010, in preparation for their widespread dissemination to the discipline communities between June and early October 2010.
- To facilitate the dissemination of these TLOs through such forums as annual conferences, discipline meetings and other executive meetings and to insure that the TLOs are 'owned' by the discipline communities.
- To act as the key group of discipline experts representing the disciplines through the peak national bodies.
- To consider (and, if possible, to endorse) the final TLOs for final reporting to the ALTC and the Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations (DEEWR) (October–November).
- To provide expert advice to the Discipline Scholar and the ALTC on the next steps to be undertaken in the Learning and Teaching Standards project once the TLOs for creative and performing arts undergraduate degrees have been approved.

### Membership

- Professor Noel Frankham, Chair, Australian Council of University Art and Design Schools (University of Tasmania - noel.frankham@utas.edu.au; 03 6226 4301)
- Professor Su Baker, Acting Dean, Victorian College of the Arts (The University of Melbourne - bakerse@unimelb.edu.au; 03 9685 9464)
- Professor Richard Vella, Chair, National Council of Tertiary Music Schools (The University of Newcastle - richard.vella@newcastle.edu.au; 02 4921 5995)
- Associate Professor Ian Maxwell, Chair, Australasian Association for Theatre Drama and Performance Studies (The University of Sydney - ian.maxwell@sydney.e.au; 02 9351 6847)
- Ms Alison Wotherspoon, Immediate Past Chair, Australian Screen Production Education & Research Association (Flinders University - alison.wotherspoon@flinders.edu.au; 08 8201 2290 or 08 8201 5121)
- Associate Professor Kim Vincs, Deputy Chair, Tertiary Dance Council of Australia (Deakin University - kim.vincs@deakin.edu.au; 0 3 9251 7663)
- Dr Marcelle Freiman, Chair, Australasian Association of Writing Programs (Macquarie University - Marcelle.freiman@humn.mq.edu.au; 02 9850 6892)
- Professor Ian Howard, Dean and Provost, College of Fine Arts, The University of New South Wales (The University of New South Wales - ian.howard@unsw.edu.au; 02 9385 0850)
- Professor Jennifer Radbourne, Dean, Faculty of Arts and Education, Deakin University (Deakin University - dean-artsed@deakin.edu.au; 03 925 17099)
- Mr Martin Cass, Founder and Director, JMC Academy, Sydney (JMC, martin@jmc.edu.au; 02 9281 8899; 02 9212 4801)
- Professor Jonathan Holmes, (Discipline Scholar, ALTC / University of Tasmania – holmes@utas.edu.au; 03 6226 4336)
- Ms Wendy Fountain, (Project Officer, ALTC / University of Tasmania - wendy.fountain@utas.edu.au; 03 6226 4318).

## Appendix 2: International, AQF and professional accreditation comparison

The two tables that follow identify the alignment of the TLOs that have been developed for the Creative and Performing Arts in the Australian Learning and Teaching Academic Standards project against the learning outcome statements, key competences and benchmark statements that have been developed in Europe, the United Kingdom and the United States. In the case of the comparative table for bachelor degree programs, reference is made only to the page source; in the case of the masters by coursework degrees, reference is also made to the actual comparative statement. There are very few references to Creative and Performing Arts learning outcome statements available at the masters degree level; an issue that is further compounded by an apparent lack of delineation of outcome statements for coursework and research masters degrees.

In Europe, comparisons have been drawn from the publications emanating from the European Tuning project in which academics in the Creative and Performing Arts have been extremely proactive. The Inter|artes Thematic Network has developed standards statements for art and design and dance and drama. Seventy-one European higher education institutes were partners in the project and this group has played an important role in developing the quality assurance agenda for the European League of Institutes of the Arts which has a membership of over 250 higher education institutes in 44 countries.

As with the Inter|artes network, the Polifonia network has developed standards for all three cycles of higher education degree programs in music in Europe. Closely linked with the Association Européenne des Conservatoires (AEC) which has a membership of over 274 higher education music institutes in 55 countries, Polifonia has developed an exemplary body of standards-related documentation that has been very valuable for the present project.

With reference to the UK, comparisons were made with benchmark statements for:

- art and design
- communication, media, film and cultural studies
- dance, drama and performance
- music
- creative writing.

Benchmark statements for the sector combine both **threshold** expectations and a range of **typical** expectations. For the following comparisons, only reference to the threshold outcomes has been made. Three-hundred-and-thirty-seven Universities and Colleges in the UK have been audited since 2004 including a large number of higher education institutions offering programs in Creative and Performing Arts.

In the United States, comparisons have been made with the learning outcome statements that are included in the accreditation guidelines published by the National Association of Schools of Art and Design [NASAD], National Association of Schools of Dance [NASD], National Association of Schools of Music [NASM] and the National Association of Schools of Theatre [NAST]. Each Association has a slightly different set of learning outcomes and expected competences and, as with the UK, reference is made to typical outcomes as well as threshold statements. Comparison has been made with the outcomes as they are expressed for discipline-specific degree programs. Reference is not made to Creative and Performing Arts programs that are offered in, say, a liberal arts or an education degree in the United States. There are 270 member institutions in NASAD; 73 in NASD; 638 in NASM; and 170 member institutions in NAST.

Creative and Performing Arts Threshold Learning Outcome	Australian Qualifications Framework (2009–10)	UK Quality Assurance Agency Benchmark Statement for Art and Design (2008)
<b>Demonstrate skills and knowledge of the practices, languages, forms, materials, technologies and techniques in the creative and performing arts discipline.</b>	◆ Strengthening the AQF: An Architecture for Australia's Qualifications. Consultation Paper, September, 2009. p. 13	◆ QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Art and Design, 2008. p.12, section 6.5
<b>Develop, research and evaluate ideas, concepts and processes through creative, critical and reflective thinking and practice.</b>	◆ Strengthening the AQF. p. 13	◆ QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Art and Design, 2008. p.12, section 6.6
<b>Apply relevant skills and knowledge to produce and realise works, artefacts and forms of creative expression.</b>	◆ Strengthening the AQF. p. 13	◆ QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Art and Design, 2008. p.11, section 6.3
<b>Interpret, communicate and present ideas, problems and arguments in modes suited to a range of audiences.</b>	◆ Strengthening the AQF. p. 13	◆ QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Art and Design, 2008. p.11, section 6.3
<b>Work independently and collaboratively in the creative and performing arts discipline in response to project demands.</b>	◆ Strengthening the AQF. p. 13	◆ QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Art and Design, 2008. p.11, section, 6.3
<b>Recognise and reflect on social, cultural and ethical issues, and apply local and international perspectives to practice in the creative and performing arts discipline.</b>	◆ Strengthening the AQF. p. 13	◆ QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Art and Design, 2008. p.11, section, 6.4

<b>UK Quality Assurance Agency Benchmark Statement for Communication, Media, Film and Cultural Studies (Revised edition, 2008)</b>	<b>UK Quality Assurance Agency Benchmark Statement for Dance, Drama and Performance (2008)</b>	<b>UK Quality Assurance Agency Benchmark Statement for Music (2008)</b>
<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Communication, Media, Film and Cultural Studies, 2008. p.18, section, 8.1</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Dance, Drama and Performance, 2008. p.10, section 7.9</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Music, 2008. p.25, para 1</p>
<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Communication, Media, Film and Cultural Studies, 2008. p.19, section, 8.2</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Dance, Drama and Performance, 2008. p.10, section 7.10</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Music, 2008. p.25, para 2</p>
<p>◆</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Dance, Drama and Performance, 2008. p.10, section 7.2</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Music, 2008. p.26, para 2</p>
<p>◆</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Dance, Drama and Performance, 2008. p.10, section 7.10</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Music, 2008. p.25, para 2</p>
<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Communication, Media, Film and Cultural Studies, 2008. p.14, section, 5.6</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Dance, Drama and Performance, 2008. p.10, 11, sections 7.10, 7.11</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Music, 2008. p.27, paras 4, 5</p>
<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Communication, Media, Film and Cultural Studies, 2008. p.19, section, 8.2</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Dance, Drama and Performance, 2008. p.10, section 7.9</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>QAA. Subject Benchmark Statement: Music, 2008. p.25, para 4</p>

Creative and Performing Arts Threshold Learning Outcome	Inter}artes Thematic Network, Theatre Tuning Document (2006)	Inter}artes Thematic Network, Performing Arts Document (2007)
<b>Demonstrate skills and knowledge of the practices, languages, forms, materials, technologies and techniques in the creative and performing arts discipline.</b>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Theatre Tuning Document 2006. p.6, para 1 (Technical and artistic Skills)</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Performing Arts Document 2007. p.18 (Skills in the specific area)</p>
<b>Develop, research and evaluate ideas, concepts and processes through creative, critical and reflective thinking and practice.</b>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Theatre Tuning Document 2008. p.8, para (Generic outcomes: Independence)</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Performing Arts Document 2007. p.19-20 (Generic outcomes: Independence and Critical Awareness)</p>
<b>Apply relevant skills and knowledge to produce and realise works, artefacts and forms of creative expression.</b>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Theatre Tuning Document 2006. p.7, para (Skills of ensemble; Professional Competences)</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Performing Arts Document 2007. p.19 (Group skills)</p>
<b>Interpret, communicate and present ideas, problems and arguments in modes suited to a range of audiences.</b>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Theatre Tuning Document 2006. p.7, (Skills of ensemble; Professional Competences)</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Performing Arts Document 2007. p.20 (Communication Skills)</p>
<b>Work independently and collaboratively in the creative and performing arts discipline in response to project demands.</b>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Theatre Tuning Document 2006. p.7, (Skills of ensemble; Professional Competences)</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Performing Arts Document 2007. p.19 (Group skills) and 19, 20 (Independence)</p>
<b>Recognise and reflect on social, cultural and ethical issues, and apply local and international perspectives to practice in the creative and performing arts discipline.</b>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Theatre Tuning Document 2006. p.8, (Contextual knowledge and understanding)</p>	<p>◆</p> <p>Inter}artes Thematic Network, Performing Arts Document 2007. p.19 (Contextual Knowledge and Understanding)</p>



**Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document (2007)**

**Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music (2009)**

**National Association of Writers in Education (UK), Creative Writing Subject Benchmark Statement, (2008)**

◆  
Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document 2007.  
p.27 (First three statements )

◆  
Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music [2009] .p. 52 (Statement 1)

◆  
National Association of Writers in Education (UK), Creative Writing Subject Benchmark Statement, 2008.  
p.7, 3.3 A

◆  
Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document 2007.  
p.27 (Statements 4 and 7)

◆  
Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music [2009]. p. 52 (Statement 2)

◆  
National Association of Writers in Education (UK), Creative Writing Subject Benchmark Statement, 2008.  
p.5, 2.7

◆  
Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document 2007.  
p.27 (Statement 6 )

◆  
Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music [2009] .p. 52 (Statement 5)

◆  
National Association of Writers in Education (UK), Creative Writing Subject Benchmark Statement, 2008.  
p.5-6, 3.1

◆  
Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document 2007.  
p.27 (Statement 9 )

◆  
Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music [2009]. p.52 (Statement 4)

◆  
National Association of Writers in Education (UK), Creative Writing Subject Benchmark Statement, 2008.  
p.5-6, 3.1

◆  
Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document 2007.  
p.27 (Statement 8 )

◆  
Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music [2009]. p.62 (Communication skills)

◆  
National Association of Writers in Education (UK), Creative Writing Subject Benchmark Statement, 2008.  
p.5, 2.7

◆  
Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document 2007.  
p.27 (Statement 10)

◆  
Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music [2009]. p. 62 (Critical skills)

◆  
National Association of Writers in Education (UK), Creative Writing Subject Benchmark Statement, 2008.  
p.5, 2.7

Creative and Performing Arts TLO	National Association of Schools of Art and Design, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) (Focus on Section VIII: All Professional Baccalaureate Degrees in Art and Design)	National Association of Schools of Music, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009)	National Association of Schools of Dance Handbook, 2009–10 (2009)	National Association of Schools of Theatre Handbook, 2009–10 (2009)
<b>Demonstrate skills and knowledge of the practices, languages, forms, materials, technologies and techniques in the creative and performing arts discipline.</b>	◆ National Association of Schools of Art and Design, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.84. See C. Results, para 1 and D. Recommendations, para 1)	◆ National Association of Schools of Music, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.90. See C. 3. Essential Competencies.	◆ National Association of Schools of Dance Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.94. See Common Body of Knowledge and Skills (4. b)	◆ National Association of Schools of Theatre Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.94. (1. a)
<b>Develop, research and evaluate ideas, concepts and processes through creative, critical and reflective thinking and practice.</b>	◆ National Association of Schools of Art and Design, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.84. See C. Results, para 3.	◆ National Association of Schools of Music, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.90. See C. 3. Essential Competencies.	◆ National Association of Schools of Dance Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.87. See B. Common Body of Knowledge and Skills (1. a)	◆ National Association of Schools of Theatre Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.82. (1.c & d)
<b>Apply relevant skills and knowledge to produce and realise works, artefacts and forms of creative expression.</b>	◆ National Association of Schools of Art and Design, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.84. See C. Results, para 2.	◆ National Association of Schools of Music, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.88. See 3. Composition and Improvisation [Section on Synthesis)	◆ National Association of Schools of Dance Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.87. See B. Common Body of Knowledge and Skills (1. b)	◆ National Association of Schools of Theatre Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.82. (1.f)
<b>Interpret, communicate and present ideas, problems and arguments in modes suited to a range of audiences.</b>	◆ National Association of Schools of Art and Design, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.83. See B Common Body of Knowledge, 1. b.	◆ National Association of Schools of Music, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.90. See C. Results, para 2	◆ National Association of Schools of Dance Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.87. See B. Common Body of Knowledge and Skills (3. a - Theoretical and Historical Studies )	
<b>Work independently and collaboratively in the creative and performing arts discipline in response to project demands.</b>		◆ National Association of Schools of Music, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.90. See D. Recommendations, para 8		◆ National Association of Schools of Theatre Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.82. (1.e & f)
<b>Recognise and reflect on social, cultural and ethical issues, and apply local and international perspectives to practice in the creative and performing arts discipline.</b>	National Association of Schools of Art and Design, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.83. See 6. General Studies (a. (1 & 3) )	National Association of Schools of Music, Handbook, 2009–10 (2009), p.89. See 3. Composition and Improvisation (Section 4. History and Repertory)	National Association of Schools of Dance Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.87. See B. Common Body of Knowledge and Skills (3. a - Theoretical and Historical Studies )	National Association of Schools of Theatre Handbook, 2009–10 (2009) p.82. (3.a, 1-3)

Creative and Performing Arts Threshold Learning Outcome	Australian Qualifications Framework (2009–10)	Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music (2009)	Inter}artes Thematic Network, Art and Design Document (2007)
<b>Integrate specialised and advanced skills with a developed knowledge of the creative and performing arts discipline.</b>	Mastery of a complex specialised field of learning or an area of professional practice. (Strengthening the AQF: An Architecture for Australia's Qualifications. Consultation Paper, September, 2009. p.13)	[Will] have demonstrated a profound and systematic understanding of a field of musical study, together with mastery of artistic and other skills associated with that field and of relevant methods of research and inquiry. Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music (2009) .p. 52 (Statement 1)	Acquire independent research skills and utilise them effectively; display evidence of professional competencies required for individual creative practice. Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document (2007). p.28
<b>Generate, research and explore ideas, concepts and processes in the field through integrated creative, critical and reflective thinking.</b>	Cognitive and technical skills to critically analyse and interpret complex information, problems, concepts and theories to provide modified constructs; communicate perspectives to specialist and non-specialist audiences. p.13	[Will be] capable of critical analysis, evaluation and synthesis of new and complex ideas, artistic concepts and processes. Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music (2009). p.52 (Statement 1)	[Will] evolve further strategies and utilise expertise, imagination and creativity in appropriate media. Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document (2007). p.28
<b>Apply and refine technical skills and specialist knowledge within a sustained and resolved body of work.</b>	Autonomy, responsibility and authority as a leading practitioner or scholar. p.13		[Will] develop own criteria for evaluating and directing work: question and contextualise individual practice and that of others. Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document (2007). p.28
<b>Interpret, communicate and present complex work and ideas to specialist and non-specialist audiences using professional conventions.</b>	A body of knowledge that provides new perspectives on current knowledge and/or for professional practices. p.13	Can communicate with their peers, the larger artistic and scholarly community and with society in general about their areas of expertise;	Articulate intentions, values and meanings of works produced to relevant audiences as well as non specialised audiences; Inter}artes Thematic Network, Arts and Design Document (2007). p.28

**Creative and Performing Arts Threshold Learning Outcome**

**Australian Qualifications Framework (2009-10)**

**Tuning Educational Structures in Europe: Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Music (2009)**

**Inter}artes Thematic Network, Art and Design Document (2007)**

**Initiate, lead, negotiate and interact with others in planning, adapting to, and executing creative and performing arts projects.**

[Will] have demonstrated the ability to conceive, design, implement and adapt a substantial process of research with artistic and scholarly integrity.

By the end of their studies the students must have:

- acquired the capacity to lead others, developing leadership abilities in an expressive and creative way, necessary to the accomplishment of all new projects;
- the ability to organise and administer their own projects, managing both human and material resources appropriately while also meeting the required deadlines for the successful execution of a project its different stages.

**Engage critically with social, cultural and ethical issues, and apply local and international perspectives to extend practice in the creative and performing arts discipline.**

## Appendix 3: Useful references

- Australian Qualifications Framework Council, (2010) *Strengthening the AQF: A framework for Australia's qualifications*, Adelaide: July 2010. [www.aqf.edu.au](http://www.aqf.edu.au)
- Baker, S & Buckley, B (2009) *CreativeArtsPhD: Future-Proofing the creative arts in higher education: Scoping for quality if creative arts doctoral programs*, Sydney: ALTC.
- Ball L, Pollard E, & Stanley N (2010) 'Creative graduates creative futures summary'. Viewed 30 April 2010. <http://www.employment-studies.co.uk/pdflibrary/471sum.pdf>
- Buckley, B & Conomos, J (2009) *Rethinking the contemporary art school: The artist, the PhD, and the academy*, Halifax, Nova Scotia: NSCAD University Press.
- De la Harpe B, Peterson F, Frankham N, Zehner R, Neale D, Musgrave E & McDermott R (2009) 'Assessment focus in studio: What is prominent in architecture, art and design?' Viewed 13 May 2010. <http://www.studioteaching.org/?page=download&file=AssessmentfocusFINAL>
- European League of Institutes of the Arts (ELIA) and Association Européenne des Conservatoires (AEC) (2010) 'Towards Strong Creative Arts Disciplines in Europe'. Viewed: 13 September 2010. [http://www.elia-artschools.org/publications/position/position\\_3.xml](http://www.elia-artschools.org/publications/position/position_3.xml)  
(Several important position papers have been produced in recent years.)
- Howard-Jones P (2008) *Fostering creative thinking: Co-constructed insights from neuroscience and education*. Viewed 30 April 2010. <http://escalate.ac.uk/downloads/4389.pdf>
- Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (2008) *Subject benchmark statement: Art and design*. Viewed: 3 December 2010. <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/ADHA08.asp>
- Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (2008) *Subject benchmark statement: Communication media, film and cultural studies*. Viewed 3 December 2010. <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/CMF08.asp>
- Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (2007) *Subject benchmark statement: Dance, drama and performance*. Viewed 3 December, 2010 <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/DDP07.asp>
- Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (2007) *Subject benchmark statement: English*. Viewed 3 December, 2010 <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/English07.asp>
- Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (2008) *Subject benchmark statement: Music*. Viewed 3 December, 2010. <http://www.qaa.ac.uk/academicinfrastructure/benchmark/statements/music08.asp>
- Lampert, N (2006) 'Critical thinking dispositions as an outcome of art education', *Studies in Art Education*, Vol.47, No.3, pp. 215–228.
- Myer, R (2002) *Report of the Contemporary Visual Arts and Craft Inquiry*, Canberra: Department of Communications, Information Technology and the Arts.
- NASAD (2009) *Handbook 2009–10*: October 2009 edn. Viewed 13 September 2010. <http://nasad.arts-accredit.org/index.jsp?page=Books>
- NASM (2009) *Handbook 2009–10*: December 2009 edn. Viewed 13 September 2010. <http://nasm.arts-accredit.org/index.jsp?page=Books>
- NAST (2010) *Handbook 2010–11*: April 2010 edn. Viewed 13 September 2010. <http://nast.arts-accredit.org/index.jsp?page=Books>

National Association of Writers in Education (2008) *Higher Education Committee creative writing subject benchmark statement and creative writing research benchmark statement*. Viewed 13 September 2010. [www.english.heacademy.ac.uk/archive/publications/reports/cwguide.pdf](http://www.english.heacademy.ac.uk/archive/publications/reports/cwguide.pdf)

Smith, H & Dean, R (eds) (2009) *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Sumsion, J & Goodfellow, J (2004) 'Identifying generic skills through curriculum mapping: a critical evaluation', *Higher Education Research and Development*, Vol. 23, No.3, pp.329 – 346.

Weatherston, D (2009) 'Nascent entrepreneurship and music students'. Viewed 30 April 2010. [www.cetl4musicne.ac.uk/Nascent%20Entrepreneurship%20publication%20extract.pdf](http://www.cetl4musicne.ac.uk/Nascent%20Entrepreneurship%20publication%20extract.pdf)

## Appendix 4: Abbreviations

AAWP	Australasian Association of Writing Programs
ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACUADS	Australian Council of University Art and Design Schools
ADSA Studies	Australasian Association for Theatre, Drama and Performance
AEC	Association Européene des Conservatoires (European Association of Conservatoires)
ALTC	Australian Learning and Teaching Council
ANZSRC	Australian and New Zealand Research Classification
AQF	Australian Qualifications Framework
ASPERA	Australian Screen Production & Research Association
DASSH	Deans of Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities
DEEWR	Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations
DRG	Discipline Reference Group
ELIA	European League of Institutes of the Arts
ICT	Information and communication technologies
LTAS project	Learning and Teaching Academic Standards project
NACTMUS	National Association of Tertiary Music Schools
NASAD	National Association of Schools of Art and Design
NASD	National Association of Schools of Dance
NASM	National Association of Schools of Music
NAST	National Association of Schools of Theatre
QAA	Quality Assurance Agency
TDCA	Tertiary Dance Council of Australia
TEQSA	Tertiary Education Quality and Standards Agency
TLO	Threshold learning outcome







Support for this project has been provided by the Australian Learning and Teaching Council Ltd., an initiative of the Australian Government. The views expressed in this report do not necessarily reflect the views of the Australian Learning and Teaching Council or the Australian Government.

This work is published under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution- Noncommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Australia Licence. Under this Licence you are free to copy, distribute, display and perform the work and to make derivative works.

**Attribution:** You must attribute the work to the original authors and include the following statement: Support for the original work was provided by the Australian Learning and Teaching Council Ltd, an initiative of the Australian Government Department.

**Noncommercial:** You may not use this work for commercial purposes.

**Share Alike:** If you alter, transform, or build on this work, you may distribute the resulting work only under a licence identical to this one.

For any reuse or distribution, you must make clear to others the licence terms of this work. Any of these conditions can be waived if you obtain permission from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/au/>

or send a letter to:  
Creative Commons

543 Howard Street, 5th Floor  
San Francisco California 94105 USA.

Requests and inquiries concerning these rights should be addressed to:

Australian Learning and Teaching Council  
PO Box 2375, Strawberry Hills NSW 2012, Australia

Telephone: 02 8667 8500

Facsimile: 02 8667 8515

[www.altc.edu.au](http://www.altc.edu.au)

ABN 30 109 826 628

2011

ISBN 978-1-921856-28-0





PO Box 2375 Strawberry Hills NSW 2012 Australia  
Telephone 02 8667 8500 Facsimile 02 8667 8515  
[www.altc.edu.au](http://www.altc.edu.au)  
ABN 30 109 826 628